

JEAN E. WILLIAMS, Deputy Assistant Attorney General
 SETH M. BARSKY, Section Chief
 MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Section Chief
 DAVIS A. BACKER, Trial Attorney (CO Bar No. 53502)
 United States Department of Justice
 Environment & Natural Resources Division
 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section
 Ben Franklin Station
 P.O. Box 7611
 Washington, DC 20044-7611
 Tel: (202) 514-5243
 Fax: (202) 305-0275
 E-mail: davis.backer@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendants

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY,) No. 3:18-cv-07211-WHA
et al.,)
)
Plaintiffs,) STIPULATED SETTLEMENT
) AGREEMENT AND
v.) [PROPOSED] ORDER
)
DAVID BERNHARDT, in his official)
capacity as Secretary of the United)
States Department of the Interior, et al.,)
)
Defendants.)

This Stipulated Settlement Agreement (“Agreement”) is entered into by and between the Center for Biological diversity (“Center”) and Environmental Protection Information Center (“EPIC”) (“collectively, “Plaintiffs”) and the United States Fish and Wildlife Service (“FWS”), and David Bernhardt, in his official capacity as Secretary of the United States of the Interior (collectively “Defendants”) who, by and through their undersigned counsel, state as follows:

1 WHEREAS, the Center submitted a petition to FWS on July 11, 2012 to list the Shasta
2 salamander (*Hydromantes shastae*) as threatened or endangered under the Endangered Species
3 Act (“ESA”), 16 U.S.C. §§ 1531, *et seq.*;

4
5 WHEREAS, on September 18, 2015, FWS issued a 90-day finding on the Center’s
6 petition to list the Shasta salamander, pursuant to 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(A), concluding that the
7 Center’s petition presented substantial scientific or commercial information indicating that listing
8 the Shasta salamander under the ESA may be warranted, 80 Fed. Reg. 56,429;

9
10 WHEREAS, on July 26, 2018 the Center sent Defendants a letter stating its intent to file
11 suit to compel FWS to issue a finding pursuant to 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(B) (“12-month finding”)
12 as to whether listing the Shasta salamander under the ESA is warranted, not warranted, or
13 warranted but precluded;

14
15 WHEREAS, on November 29, 2018, Plaintiffs filed the above-captioned action to compel
16 FWS to issue a 12-month finding as to whether the listing of the Shasta salamander is warranted,
17 not warranted, or warranted but precluded;

18
19 WHEREAS, the Parties, through their authorized representatives, and without any final
20 adjudication of the issues of fact or law with respect to Plaintiff’s claims, have negotiated a
21 settlement that they consider to be a just, fair, adequate, and equitable resolution of the disputes
22 set forth in Plaintiff’s Complaint;

23
24 WHEREAS, the Parties agree that settlement of this action in this manner is in the public
25 interest and is an appropriate way to resolve Plaintiffs’ Complaint;

26
27 NOW, THEREFORE, the Parties hereby stipulate and agree as follows:
28

- 1 1. No later than April 30, 2021, FWS shall review the status of the Shasta salamander and
2 submit to the *Federal Register* for publication a 12-month finding as to whether listing
3 the Shasta salamander is warranted pursuant to the ESA, 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(B);
- 4 2. The Order entering this Agreement may be modified by the Court upon good cause shown,
5 consistent with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, by written stipulation between the
6 Parties filed with and approved by the Court, or upon written motion filed by one of the
7 Parties and granted by the Court. In the event that either Party seeks to modify the terms
8 of this Agreement, including the deadline specified in Paragraph 1, or in the event of a
9 dispute arising out of or relating to this Agreement, or in the event that either Party
10 believes that the other Party has failed to comply with any term or condition of this
11 Agreement, the Party seeking the modification, raising the dispute, or seeking
12 enforcement shall provide the other Party with notice of the claim or modification. The
13 Parties agree that they will meet and confer (either telephonically or in person) at the
14 earliest possible time in a good-faith effort to resolve the claim before seeking relief from
15 the Court. If the Parties are unable to resolve the claim themselves, either Party may seek
16 relief from the Court.
- 17 3. In the event that Defendants fail to meet the deadline in Paragraph 1 and have not sought
18 to modify this Agreement, Plaintiffs' first remedy shall be a motion to enforce the terms
19 of this Agreement, after following the dispute resolution procedures described above. This
20 Agreement shall not, in the first instance, be enforceable through a proceeding for
21 contempt of court.
- 22 4. This Agreement requires only that Defendants take the action specified in Paragraph 1.
23 No provision of this Agreement shall be interpreted as, or constitute, a commitment or
24
25
26
27
28

1 requirement that Defendants take action in contravention of the ESA, the Administrative
2 Procedure Act (“APA”), or any other law or regulation, either substantive or procedural.
3 Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed to limit or modify the discretion accorded
4 to Defendants by the ESA, APA, or general principles of administrative law with respect
5 to the procedures to be followed in making any determination required herein, or as to the
6 substance of any determinations made pursuant to Paragraph 1 of the Agreement. To
7 challenge any final determination issued pursuant to Paragraph 1, Plaintiffs must file a
8 separate action. Defendants reserve the right to raise any applicable claims or defenses to
9 such challenges.
10

11
12 5. No part of this Agreement shall have precedential value in any litigation or in
13 representations before any court or forum or in any public setting. No Party shall use this
14 Agreement or the terms herein as evidence of what does or does not constitute a reasonable
15 timeline for issuing a 12-month listing decision for any listed species.
16

17 6. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed or offered as evidence in any proceeding as
18 an admission or concession of any wrongdoing, liability, or any issue of fact or law
19 concerning the claims settled under this Agreement or any similar claims brought in the
20 future by any other party. Except as expressly provided in this Agreement, none of the
21 Parties waives or relinquishes any legal rights, claims, or defenses it may have. This
22 Agreement is executed for the purpose of settling Plaintiffs’ Complaint, and nothing
23 herein shall be construed as precedent having preclusive effect in any other context.
24

25 7. Without waiving any defenses or making any admissions, Defendant agrees to pay
26 Plaintiff \$6,000 in attorneys’ fees and costs. Plaintiff agrees to accept the \$6,000 from
27 Defendant in full satisfaction of any and all claims, demands, rights, and causes of action
28

1 for any and all attorneys' fees and costs Plaintiff reasonably incurred in connection with
2 the above captioned litigation through the signing of this Agreement.

3 8. Plaintiff agrees to furnish Defendant with the information necessary to effectuate the
4 \$6,000 payment set forth by Paragraph 8. Payment will be made to the Center by
5 electronic funds transfer. Defendant agrees to submit all necessary paperwork for the
6 processing of the attorneys' fees award within fifteen (15) days from receipt of the
7 necessary information from Plaintiff or from approval of this Agreement by the Court,
8 whichever is later.
9

10 9. By this agreement, Defendant does not waive any right to contest fees and costs claimed
11 by Plaintiff or Plaintiff's counsel in any future litigation or continuation of the present
12 action.
13

14 10. Nothing in this Agreement shall be interpreted as, or shall constitute, a requirement that
15 Defendants are obligated to pay any funds exceeding those available, or take any action
16 in contravention of the Anti-Deficiency Act, 31 U.S.C. § 1341, or any other applicable
17 appropriations law.
18

19 11. The Parties agree that this Agreement was negotiated in good faith and that it constitutes
20 a settlement of claims that were dispute by the Parties. By entering into this Agreement,
21 none of the Parties waive any legal rights, claims, or defenses except as expressly stated
22 herein. This Stipulation contains all of the terms of agreement between the Parties
23 concerning the Complaint, and is intended to be the final and sole agreement between the
24 Parties with respect thereto. The Parties agree that any prior or contemporaneous
25 representations or understanding not explicitly contained in this written Agreement,
26 whether written or oral, are of no further legal or equitable force or effect.
27
28

12. The undersigned representatives of each Party certify that they are fully authorized by the Party or Parties they represent to agree to the terms and conditions of this Agreement and do hereby agree to the terms herein. Further, each Party, by and through its undersigned representative, represents and warrants that it has the legal power and authority to enter into this Agreement and bind itself to the terms and conditions contained in this Agreement.

13. The terms of this Agreement shall become effective upon entry of an Order by the Court ratifying this Agreement.

14. Upon adoption of this Agreement by the Court, all counts of Plaintiffs' Complaint shall be dismissed with prejudice. Notwithstanding the dismissal of this action, however, the Parties hereby stipulate and respectfully request that the Court retain jurisdiction to oversee compliance with the terms of this Agreement and to resolve any motions to modify such terms. *See Kokkonen v. Guardian Life Ins. Co. of Am.*, 511 U.S. 375 (1994).

Dated: June 26, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jennifer L. Loda

JENNIFER L. LODA (CA Bar No. 284889)
Center for Biological Diversity
1212 Broadway, Ste. 800
Oakland, CA 94612
Phone: 510-844-7100 x336
Email: jloda@biologicaldiversity.org

JEAN E. WILLIAMS

Deputy Assistant Attorney General
SETH M. BARSKY
Section Chief
MEREDITH L. FLAX
Assistant Section Chief

BRIAN SEGEE (CA Bar No. 200795)

Center for Biological Diversity
660 S. Figueroa St., Ste. 1000
Los Angeles, CA 90017
Phone: (805) 750-8852
Email: bsegee@biologicaldiversity.org

/s/ Davis A. Backer

DAVIS A. BACKER
Trial Attorney (CO Bar No. 53502)
United States Department of Justice
Environment & Natural Resources Division
Wildlife & Marine Resources Division
Ben Franklin Station
P.O. Box 7611
Washington, D.C. 20044-7611

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Tel: (202 514-5243
Fax: (202) 305-0275
Email: davis.backer@usdoj.gov

H. HUBERT YANG
Trial Attorney (DC Bar No. 491308)
United States Department of Justice
Environment & Natural Resources Division
Wildlife & Marine Resources Section
Ben Franklin Station
P.O. Box 7611
Washington, DC 20044-7611
Tel: (202) 305-0209
Fax: (202) 305-0275
E-mail: hubert.yang@usdoj.gov

Of Counsel:

LUKE MILLER
United States Department of the Interior
Office of the Solicitor
Pacific Southwest Regional Office

Attorneys for Defendants

~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER

The Stipulated Settlement Agreement is approved and all Parties shall comply with its provisions.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: June 27, 2019

By: THE CLERK OF COURT
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

